

Outcome Report of the Dublin City Brexit Summit

Dublin City Hall, 13th July, 2016

Hosted by Cllr Paul McAuliffe, Chairperson, Enterprise and Economic Development Strategic Policy Committee, Dublin City Council



Contents

Section	Page
Chairperson's Introduction	3
Executive Summary	4
Negotiations	5
Trade and Commerce	8
Capacity and Infrastructure	10
Tourism	13
Education and Research	16
Conclusion	18
Appendix 1: List of speakers in order of contribution	19



Chairperson's Introduction

On June $23^{\rm rd}$ 2016, the electorate of the United Kingdom voted in a referendum to leave the European Union. The outcome was a surprise to commentators and experts in the UK and Ireland.

Three weeks later, on the morning of July 13th 2016, on the day Theresa May became the British Prime Minister, Dublin City Council's Enterprise and Economic Development Strategic Policy Committee and Local Enterprise Office hosted a Brexit Summit in the Council Chamber of City Hall.

The Summit focused on the potential challenges and opportunities facing Dublin City following the referendum. Representatives of the Irish and British Governments, elected members of Dublin City Council and representatives from a cross section of relevant business and economic stakeholders in the city attended the summit.

Eoghan Murphy TD, Minister of State for Financial Services, eGovernment and Public Procurement, and the British Ambassador to Ireland Dominick Chilcott, represented the Irish and British governments, respectively. The Lord Mayor of Dublin Brendan Carr, John McGrane of the British-Irish Chamber of Commerce and Dan O'Brien of the Institute of International and European Affairs were also among the key contributors.

In the first public initiative of its kind in Ireland, participants discussed the broad range of challenges and opportunities facing Ireland and Dublin in particular, presented by the United Kingdom's exit from the European Union.

While it quickly became apparent that there were a number of opportunities arising from the UK's departure, there was no doubting the level of challenge identified across many sectors throughout the meeting.

We hope this outcome report and the recorded <u>webcast</u> proves useful to national negotiators before and after the official triggering of Article 50 negotiations.

Cllr Paul McAuliffe

Chairperson, Enterprise and Economic Development Strategic Policy Committee, Dublin City Council

Webcast - Dublin Brexit Summit (Wed, 13th Jul 2016 – 10:00 am) Available at: https://dublincity.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast interactive/234854



Executive Summary

In the immediate aftermath of the Brexit vote, it was agreed there was great uncertainty about the impact of the decision on Ireland, and Dublin. A number of speakers urged caution in Ireland's approach to the British exit negotiations, while acknowledging that Ireland would play a crucial role in those talks.

Several speakers expressed the view that a bad exit deal for Britain would also be a bad deal for Ireland.

While there was a strong sense that opportunities existed for Ireland in post-Brexit Europe, it was also recognized the expected new order would present many challenges for Ireland and its capital city.

Not least among these were the exchange rate, the possible reintroduction of a hard border between Northern Ireland and the Republic and trade tariffs. It was recognised that tourism and some exporters had already been adversely affected by a weakened sterling.

The relocation of financial services and other sectors from London to Dublin was among the clear benefits identified by a number of speakers. However, it was also recognised that such services were actively looking to other European centres as possible relocation centres, including Paris, Amsterdam and Frankfurt.

There was also a threat of job losses if services exporters, such as legal services being provided from Dublin to the UK, decided to relocate to London to avoid new tariffs and additional red tape.

Representatives of higher education addressed the meeting on the impact for UK students in Ireland and Irish students studying in UK institutions, as well as on the impact for research initiatives.

In the drive to attract businesses and jobs to Dublin, the summit was told the message needed to go out that Ireland was staying in the European Union, and that Dublin was a great place to do business.

There was a realisation that pre-existing capacity and infrastructure issues were now brought into sharper focus by Brexit, and needed to be addressed to allow Dublin to maximise opportunities presented.

Among the areas of concern were education funding and research, capacity at Dublin Airport, the M50, public transport, hotel accommodation, office space, and the scarcity and cost of residential accommodation in the city. Several speakers underlined the role of Dublin City Council as a planner and regulator in helping to alleviate some of these problems.



Negotiations

Throughout the summit there was recognition among the participants that Ireland would have an important role in the Brexit negotiations, and that the outcome of those negotiations would have a strong bearing on Ireland's future in the EU and as a close trading partner with the UK.

Minister Murphy told the summit that a huge amount of work was already being undertaken behind the scenes in relation to Brexit. "One of the key things we are trying to do is have a whole-country approach to this. We want to work with everyone and are getting a great response from all stakeholders to have this as an approach, to make sure we have a strong output that is very much in Ireland's national interest."

He said that while the exit result was unexpected, a contingency framework to deal with that eventuality was in place and a summary published. He said the immediate aftermath of the decision had resulted in "incredible uncertainty". He said when Article 50 is invoked "probably in the first or second month of next year we will move into the negotiations stage."

"As we move towards a more certain political situation we will be able to better understand what line the UK will take in the negotiations. And our side will be able to prepare for these negotiations...the situation is complex because we have to message into a number of different markets for different reasons."

The key message was that Ireland was staying in the EU and "we need to get that message out very strongly. It is made more difficult because we have a very clear association with the UK, not just economically but historically and culturally. And we have to try to find that balance."

"The Irish Government's view and Ireland's view is that the best outcome is the UK being as close to the EU as possible post-negotiations... [to have the] UK EU-facing and ideally with access to the single market. That is what would work best for everyone."

"If the UK has a hard exit it is going to hurt us. We want to make sure that they don't and we are working in that regard. Where there are new opportunities, we will take them of course."

The Minister said there were "meetings happening that you won't be reading a lot about because we need to take a calm and cool approach to this... [and we] will be making a considered response. That does not mean we are going to move slowly; it means we are going to move carefully."

Ambassador Chilcott agreed with Minister Murphy saying, "the watchword is uncertainty". He said the UK's future access to the single market would "be constrained by our wish to put controls on immigration into the UK by EU citizens. None of us knows what the answer is except we hear very loudly and clearly the statements of other EU member states that you cannot have full access to the single market without accepting the free movement of people."



He said the British Business Secretary had already visited India and he predicted other high level approaches to a number of governments around the world in search of trade deals.

"Unfortunately, there can be no side deal in trade between the UK and Ireland. We will be subject to the same rules that will apply between the UK and all the EU states."

Lord Mayor of Dublin Brendan Carr said his counterpart; the Lord Mayor of London had approached him with a view to establishing a working group to help support the interests of both cities.

He said he had also been contacted by ambassadors from countries outside of the EU asking if "they can meet a delegation to start doing trade because they realise they are going to be looking for a new place" to do business.

Ireland needs to get ready to support the negotiating process in a very positive and constructive way, according to Mr McGrane of the British-Irish Chamber of Commerce. "A bad deal in Europe for Britain is a bad deal for Ireland. A deal that makes it more difficult for Britain to trade into Europe makes it more difficult for Ireland to trade with the UK."

He suggested the establishment of a Lord Mayor's Forum on a similar scale as the council summit but on a permanent basis "for the duration of the challenge/opportunity." He said the message; "This town is open for business" must go out. The Chamber campaigned very actively to see a strong UK remain improving and reforming the EU.

"Our friends in the UK have an existential crisis in some cases for some of their businesses. They are hit far more than we are and are looking for solutions just as we are."

The **Irish Congress of Trade Unions** would have preferred a different outcome to the referendum, **Peter Rigney**, of The Congress told the summit. He said Ireland had faced similar negotiating challenges on only two other occasions – the negotiations for Ireland's withdrawal from the Commonwealth in 1948 and the entry negotiations to the EEC in the late 1960s and early1970s.

He said Ireland was faced with a new challenge of regulating borders and labour markets, but he indicated lessons could be drawn from the current UK experience. "If you look at the discourse in Britain around London in the past number of years, London is portrayed as a financial services centre sucking the life out of the rest of the country."

"We need to avoid that. We need to go forward on a whole-country basis, with local authorities doing what they can, where they can. This is huge and will require the input of all the stakeholders." He said "the effort was being coordinated very well by the Department of An Taoiseach and local authorities may well have a role to play in steering us through these rocky rapids."



Simon McKeever of the Irish Exporters Association said, "The message we need to give to our national politicians is if the UK exit goes ahead the way Theresa May has said it will, the status quo is not possible anymore. It is not possible Britain will have full access to EU markets if they restrict the free movement of people. It is incumbent on our Government to make sure we set out at the negotiations what is best for Ireland."

Richard Guiney of Dublin Town echoed a cautious, steady approach. "The current period is one of massive uncertainty. Now is not the time to be making rash decisions. We need to be conscious of the environment we are in and the decisions we make need to take into account the environment we are heading into."

Mary Freehill, Leader of the Irish delegation on the Committee for the Regions, said she had recently returned from a meeting of the committee in Bratislava. "There is a great willingness to try to work together to support the British members, who are devastated [by the result]. They talk about it like bereavement in their own family. The level of distress was just amazing."

She said: "what we need to do as much as possible is prevent triggering Article 50", adding: "there is something like 200 agreements as part of the UK membership of the EU so it is a highly complex operation."

Cllr Deirdre Heney, Fianna Fail, said Ireland needs to work with Britain in the Brexit negotiations because "a bad deal for Britain has the capacity to negatively impact here."

Sinn Fein's Cllr Greg Kelly said the negotiations represented an opportunity to implement parts of the Good Friday Agreement that are outstanding, and to advance a "full-Ireland economy".

Cllr Micheal MacDonncha, Sinn Fein, expressed concern about the impact of Brexit on people living in Northern Ireland. "The people of the Six Counties voted to remain and I think that is a very important factor...and needs to be to the fore in the Irish Government's negotiating position."

"If Article 50 is triggered they will be dragged out of the EU without reference to the rest of Ireland with huge consequences, not least the immediate impact on the Dublin-Belfast corridor."

Giving participants an indication of what was happening at official level, **Dermot Mulligan**, **Assistant Secretary at the Department of Jobs**, **Enterprise and Innovation**, said the day after the Brexit decision, Minister Mary Mitchell O'Connor had meetings with "some of the agencies and stakeholders who are here today to look at what we needed to do to implement the contingency plans we had made."

He said the Minister had established a group in the Department "to co-ordinate all the agencies that support businesses."



Trade and Commerce

Prior to the referendum there was much talk about a dividend for Ireland, and Dublin in particular, in terms of financial services providers relocating from London to Dublin, to maintain a presence within the EU in an English-speaking country.

Dan O'Brien said as far as foreign direct investment was concerned Brexit was a positive for Ireland but warned that a downside existed for some services exports, such as legal services to the United Kingdom from Ireland. Such service exporters could decide to move to the UK to avoid having to pay tariffs on the service they provide into that jurisdiction.

On the upside Mr O'Brien said Britain had the second largest stock in the world from foreigners in its economy, and that some of that stock would now consider moving.

Mr McGrane said the trade between Ireland and Britain "makes us economically joined at the hip." He said: "There is no point wishing for some top end exotic skills that simply won't migrate...they will go to other places. We should think of the sectors and sub-sectors, back office and middle office that are absolutely right for this town and we are right for them."

Britain is Ireland's largest two-way trading partner by a long mile, he added, referring to a "seismic shock" delivered to the relationship by Brexit. "We do more than €1bn in trade a week – that's 400,000 jobs on both islands...we would find that difficult to replace. It is a good time to think about the strength of what connects us rather than issues that divide us over the next while."

"Nearly 40pc of our indigenous exports go to the UK," he said, adding that in some ways the indigenous sector was even more important than the foreign direct investment firms based in Ireland. This is "because our indigenous companies are more typically small and medium enterprises and in many cases are family businesses. In the past year they have been providing more new jobs than FDI."

Brexit may make trade more complicated and more expensive and reduce the likelihood of future investment compared to the past. "Ireland needed to minimise that effect", he said.

"We will get Foreign Direct Investment – it is already happening." He said some firms had been planning as long as 18 months ago about where they might move to if the UK left the EU. "Dublin is perfectly placed to work on the sectors that it makes sense to invite into this fine city and region...in partnership with people in the UK, who need a friend."

Simon McKeever said the **Irish Exporters Association** was encouraging its members to conduct an impact assessment using different exchange rates for sterling. He said a number of larger companies had already done this but because many smaller companies did not have the resources, the association was



working with larger operations with a view to developing a tool kit that could be used by smaller enterprises.

The most immediate downside was the decline in the value of sterling immediately after the decision to leave became clear but many participants looked to the future at ways to mitigate that and other damaging outcomes for Ireland, and Dublin.

Mr O'Brien told the summit "it was overwhelmingly negative for Ireland that Britain leaves the EU." He said Brexit could mean more barriers, and that would mean less trade. "That is negative for us," he said.

Peter Rigney, Irish Congress of Trade Unions said The Congress was a cross-Border and a national organisation and "though it does not apply to Dublin, the big potential hit of Brexit is in the agriculture sector and the food sector" and those exporting from those sectors.

Minister Murphy was cautious in his address stating: "There are opportunities but net we are looking at a loss in so many ways, even when you look at financial services. Yes, there are opportunities there but the key thing is to recognise that we complement the UK financial services sector; we compete with them in some areas but we also complement them. We are never going to become a big London-City-type player."

Mr Guiney, of Dublin Town, an organisation that represents the interests of Dublin city retailers, confirmed the challenge the decrease in the value of sterling caused to the retail trade, pointing out that 40 per cent of the city centre's stores belonged to UK retail store chains.

"There are concerns [including increased red tape] even if we don't get in to tariffs, and if we do there will be an inflationary aspect to it because these charges will be passed on to the consumer." He said the city had been performing well and had turned a corner. However, he said the pre-existing and growing popularity of online shopping would continue to be a challenge, regardless of the effects of Brexit.

"Irish people are spending €14,000 per minute online, and that is growing at 40pc per annum. If there is a massive decrease in the value of sterling it will make products from the UK more expensive."



Capacity and Infrastructure

Dublin's ability to take advantage of opportunities that arose as a result of Brexit was a running theme throughout the discussion. The capacity of the existing infrastructure to bear that extra weight and to be expanded arose again and again, particularly with regard to housing, transport, and hotel and office space. It was agreed by a number of speakers that many of these capacity issues predated Brexit, which now brought them into sharper focus.

Office space: It was accepted that financial services and other London-based services were looking to Dublin but also to Frankfurt, Amsterdam and Paris as possible relocation centres. Dublin's ability to meet a growth in demand for office space was a concern for a number of speakers.

Minister Murphy said he had recently met with the National Asset Management Agency (NAMA) regarding the strategic development zones. He said there was enough office space coming on stream "that we might be able to handle any uptake [in demand] as a result of Brexit."

Mr McGrane said some capacity issues were "self-inflicted; some not". His information from building developers seemed to support the Minister's view that there would be sufficient office stock to meet need. However, he said "we will continue to need more so what Dublin City Council can do is make sure it is fast-tracking the planning process for the office capacity we want to attract in businesses."

The largest number of queries received about office space in Dublin recently had come from the technology sector, said **Marie Hunt of CBRE**, which is one of the world's largest commercial real estate services and investment firms.

"That is because they are fearful of immigration controls" being introduced in the UK, which may restrict their ability to hire the staff they need. She said there was potential to attract financial services operators not just from London but from other centres as well. In addition, she said there was potential to attract industry, including from the bio-pharma and medical technology areas.

She said that while there had been a lot of discussion about under supply of office stock, the issue could be "over supply when you realise what is in the planning process...I would suggest there are about 28 office schemes under construction in the city today."

"There is probably at least that much again that have a grant of planning, which could quickly get on site should they get the funding in place." She said she was not overly concerned about the lack of office stock.

Housing: Ms Hunt said: "The number one issue occupiers are asking about today is housing...they are looking at the Daft report and seeing what the current cost of rental accommodation is and they are panicked because they think this is going to have big implications on them from a wage point of view. So we really have to use the next few years very cleverly and get the housing situation fixed."



Ms Hunt also said there was a shortage of industrial sheds, which are typically to be found on the city's periphery.

"It is not just financial services occupiers from London [who are looking for office space]. It is much bigger than that and we need to be ready and coordinated. It is great to have something like this [summit] so that we can put together a co-ordinated response as opposed to us all trying to do the same thing 100 different ways."

Minister Murphy said housing and the cost of rent was a huge issue. "It is coming up as a factor when people are thinking about moving across... how much disposable income will they have at the end of the day."

Mr Rigney acknowledged that, "There are ferocious housing constraints on local authorities in relation to what they can do directly but I was alarmed to see the city manager saying in relation to derelict sites that the council had a relaxed approach in the past. There are an awful lot of derelict sites in the city."

"One positive thing the local authorities could do is redouble their efforts in coming down hard on site occupiers, which would propel those properties into housing."

"The introduction of a vacant site levy would help alleviate the problem of vacant buildings and sites by taking speculators out of the market", said **Patrick Davitt, Institute of Professional Auctioneers and Valuers**. He said careful planning was required in deciding where development should take place.

He said the property market was starting to recover from price drops of up to 70 per cent during the recession "but at a time like Brexit, negativity and uncertainty is one thing the property market does not need."

There is a lot of that at the moment in relation to the London and Dublin property market and many opportunities that Brexit presents could slip by us if "negativity comes into the market". He agreed that it was very important to deal with the housing issue.

Kieran Rose, a senior city planner and activist, said one of the great problems and one of the great opportunities of Dublin was 60 hectares of vacant land in the inner city. He said it was a problem in terms of quality of life but gave Dublin a huge competitive advantage compared to other cities that had fully developed inner cities and didn't have any more space for hotels or office space.

Mr Rose's remarks echoed those of **Alan Robinson of the Dublin Docklands Forum,** who earlier said decisions taken by Dublin City Council made a difference to the daily life of the city and "how we most effectively embrace the opportunities presented to us."



He called for planning flexibility to provide appropriate office space for corporates who wanted to relocate here. He said such development in the docklands area would allow families to return to Georgian Dublin.

The council has the opportunity to lead the development of a maritime quarter at the eastern end of the River Liffey and the Grand Canal Basin, which could attract major international yachts into the area, allowing those aboard easy access to hotels, cafes, restaurants and the city centre.

In addition, the development would provide what Mr Robinson said international corporates in the docklands area referred to as "non-remunerative benefits" – the things that go beyond pay – which staff were looking for, such as a great place to live.

Minister Murphy agreed that infrastructural issues were a big challenge, linked to the council's powers and responsibilities. "We have a huge issue that can only be addressed through the development plan and decisions that are made by the city council that make sure we are building and growing our city in the most efficient way from a sustainable point of view, from an economic point of view, and a social living point of view. That is the key challenge you face in particular as a city council."

A number of public representatives expressed concerns about the housing situation in Dublin, including Cllr Deirdre Heney, Fianna Fail, who asked that the Council be given permission to manage housing development on two large sites owned by the council. She said the provision of affordable, social housing would ease the pressure in the accommodation crisis.

Cllr Michael O'Brien, AAA, said that "month after month" council and government officials remind councillors of the deficit rules that "prevent us from not just raising the finance but using the finance available from the Exchequer to deal with the housing crisis. Those rules need to be openly challenged by this Government and broken if we are going to deal with the biggest challenge this city faces, which is the homelessness crisis."

Airport: Tim Fenn of the Irish Hotels' Federation told the summit that 27 million passengers passed through Dublin Airport in 2015 and that figure was expected to increase by 50 per cent over five years.

Minister Murphy said if the projections are accurate, it would put huge demand on the infrastructure of the city. He said it was an important time now to sit and reflect on the challenges as well as the opportunities, challenges, which he said were not beyond "our ability as a collective group to solve."

Mr Rigney said a European directive that mandates that all primary airports will be connected to the national rail network by 2030 or 2040 "seems to have fallen off the planning agenda in Dublin despite the fact that there is a land reservation for that between Clongriffin and Dublin Airport."



Tourism

Mr McGrane said the tourism sector was already being massively impacted by the Brexit decision. "The democratic will of our own best friends has imposed a 20pc extra price point for visits to Ireland compared to what we had in February. We have an opportunity to protect as much of the business as possible. Don't waste a good crisis."

Adrian Cummins, Restaurant Association of Ireland said the association represented more than 850 members in Dublin. He pointed out that four and half years growth in tourism business had resulted in the creation of 41,900 jobs, 11,000 of these in Dublin, and mostly in the areas of accommodation and food services.

He said British tourism was the largest tourist market for Dublin with 1.2 million British tourists visiting Dublin on an annual basis. The immediate impact of Brexit on Sterling was a concern because the fall in the currency would make visiting Ireland more expensive for UK residents.

"It is all about competitiveness. We have to make sure we are competitive in the eyes of the British tourist." He said the association's Dublin members were calling for the marketing campaign for Dublin to be reinforced in the UK. He said it was necessary to avoid duplication in this regard and called for a co-ordinated approach.

"From a tourism perspective, Brexit will have a negative impact," **Owen O'Mara Walsh, Irish Tourist Industry Confederation** told the summit. "It is a case of what we can do to minimise the negative impact, particularly during this period of uncertainty."

According to the Central Statistics Office, tourism employed one in every seven people in Dublin city, he said, adding that tourism was probably Dublin's largest indigenous employer; bigger than the financial services sector, and construction.

"It is vital. Dublin is a very attractive destination for British people; they come in their droves and spend just shy of €1bn a year." He said the federation was concerned about the exchange rate and the impact that has on the value for money which Ireland and Dublin offers.

"If the British economy weakens, as we fear it will, there will be a lack of customer confidence and less discretionary income in people's pockets for overseas holidays, which is bound to impact on travel and tourism as a whole."

Mr O'Mara Walsh said, "If we remain competitive, there are opportunities there as well. We have an opportunity to grasp as much of the market as possible", pointing out that the exchange rate would affect Spain, France and other destinations as well as Ireland. He said competitiveness was absolutely key.



"We need to moderate our price increases and make sure we offer value for money." He said the local authority had to ensure there were no additional new taxes on the sector.

Referring to a discussion by the council's strategic policy committee on the introduction of a bed tax, a tourism tax, Mr O'Mara Walsh said: "To our mind that would be a bad idea because it adds costs to the system and worsens Dublin's competitiveness."

The supply of hotels was an area of concern for many sector representatives, not least tourism. Mr O'Mara-Walsh said the lack of hotels in Dublin was a big issue.

"Demand from overseas visitors is going through the roof, which is fantastic and great for the local economy but the number of hotels in Dublin has reduced over the last five years due to the property and banking crash."

He said there was upward pressure on prices with the risk that Dublin would become uncompetitive. He said as much as possible should be done to increase the attractiveness of hotel development to investors.

"We need about 50 hotels. It is not just tourism but foreign direct investment relocating to Dublin that will be looking very closely at the infrastructure of the city, including hotel stock."

He said the council had a role in fast tracking planning in strategic development zones or being more proactive in positioning Dublin as an attractive location for investors in the hotel sector.

However, Minister Murphy said he did not think there was any question of the Government going back to incentivising hotel building. In addition, he said hotels were going to come under a lot of pressure regarding the continuation of the discounted 9pc VAT rate if prices were going up.

In addition, Lord Mayor Carr said: "Cllr Mary Freehill has been fighting for a bed tax for years. The hotel industry has never supported it. We didn't have to have Brexit as an excuse not to support the bed tax."

Hotel capacity was also a concern for Mr Fenn, Irish Hotels Federation, who told the meeting that having survived a loss of 30pc of visitors from Great Britain as a result of the economic crash, Dublin was again facing a period of great uncertainty post Brexit.

He said some of the possible losses in UK traffic could be offset by tourist traffic from North America as the US\$ continued to stay strong and business had been very good. He said there had been a massive change in hotel ownership over the past couple of years, which was a very difficult time in terms of investment.

"It was easier to buy distressed assets in recent years so there was no money going into new build."



On the plus side, he said that in 2015, Dublin had the highest rate of occupancy of any city in the EU along with London at 82.2pc, while being 15th highest in Europe in terms of average room rate. Occupancy continued to grow in 2016 and prices were also rising, he said.

The potential pressure on Dublin Airport was also outlined by Mr Fenn, who said that 27 million passengers passed through the airport in 2015; a figure that may increase by 50pc in the next five years with the provision of the new runway and other developments. "That will have a massive impact on the numbers of people who will visit the city."

The changing situation because of Brexit was one tourism and hotel stakeholders had to be ready and able to react to, from a marketing point of view. While cautioning in regard to the impact on price of increasing labour costs, Mr Fenn said a career in the sector should be made attractive as a career for life, with training to attract people to the sector.

"Competitiveness is what it is all about. We have to maintain that to continue to grow the GB market."

However, a number of speakers were concerned about the concentration on competitiveness and what this could mean. "We have to be careful that we do not have a further race to the bottom in terms of pay and conditions for workers", Cllr MacDonnacha said.

Cllr Michael O' Brien of the Anti-Austerity Alliance said "the narrative that Irish workers were not competitive needed to be punctured. Competitiveness was a byword for pay cuts and pay restraint." He said the elected chamber of Dublin City Council had a concept of supporting a living wage and all that entailed. "We could be on a collision course between the unions and some of the organisations represented here over some of these issues," he said.



Education and Research

The impact of Brexit on education, particularly fees and research funding collaboration, was an issue raised by several summit participants. Minister Murphy addressed some of these issues during his contribution to the meeting.

He said Ireland and Dublin faced challenges in meeting the needs of people who might be coming into the country, who are looking for options such as Educate Together or international baccalaureate. "These might seem like small things but when you are looking for a place to relocate and you are trying to move with a family these things are very important."

Deiric O'Broin, Dublin City University said that significant under-funding of higher education was a problem that existed separate to Brexit. He said fees and participation in Erasmus programmes were the two major issues facing higher education post-Brexit.

He pointed out that Swiss students lost access to the Erasmus programme by virtue of being outside the EU. "Erasmus may not be an offering in three years time to UK students. What are the knock-on effects here for us? We take a significant number of students from the UK." However, Mr O'Broin reiterated the view that "many of the problems we are facing are non-Brexit problems though they do bleed over into the Brexit space."

He said there was an issue with how to proceed with funding applications for programmes such as Horizon 20/20 programmes, which had previously been done on a joint basis with UK institutions. "This is unchartered territory" he said, adding that there was major concern in the area of research because the university worked with British partners on EU-funded programmes.

Aoife Ni Mhaolain, Trinity College was also concerned about the degree of uncertainty created by Brexit, especially for current students from Northern Ireland studying in the Republic. "What status will they have in two years? Will they continue as European students paying European fees or will they be non-European students paying much higher fees?"

However, Ms Ni Mhaolain pointed to one potential positive of Brexit: "Irish universities will rocket to the top of the leading English-speaking universities in Europe, which will help with our rankings and research opportunities." She cautioned however, that with the system strained such a development "might overwhelm us, which comes back to funding and fees again."

David Kirk, Dublin Institute of Technology told the summit there were just under 11,000 Irish students studying at UK universities. "As we look to the future, what will be their status? Currently, they are viewed as any other British student. If they are viewed as international students then their fees are going to sky rocket."



He also pointed out that third-level education institutions here had very strong links with Northern Ireland, and that many of the research initiatives being funded through funding programmes were very much all-Ireland initiatives.

"How are English or Northern Ireland students viewed in terms of funding proposals? How will the UK universities be viewed in terms of being partners in these cross-Border funding initiatives?" He believed much would depend on the negotiations to take place around the UK's departure from the EU.

Graham Love, Health Research Board, told the summit that with regard to health and medical research, "I would characterise the potential impact on Ireland of Brexit as low at the moment." He said there was anecdotal evidence that UK partners were already being asked not to join pan-European bids for research funding. He felt this presented an opportunity for certain Irish research consortia to step in.

Mr Love also pointed out that during the last European funding framework: Programme 7, the UK put in 5bn euro and took out 8bn euro and was thus a major net beneficiary. He added that "because the UK has been such a science power house it has been a major attractor of inward scientific intellectual capital and mobility for many years."

He said Dublin is a very attractive location for people looking to relocate in the post-Brexit era as long as Dublin had the capacity to take advantage of such an opportunity to import top clinical and medical talent.

He also suggested that Dublin could be the new home of the European Medicines Agency, the EU's medial regulator, which will be obliged to relocate from its current London base, with the potential of bringing up to 2,000 highly skilled staff to Ireland.



Conclusion

- 1. Ireland must play a full and central role in the negotiations to provide for Britain's exit from the European Union. In a time of great uncertainty, caution and a steady approach was called for. Ireland should work to allow the UK to get a good exit deal because a bad deal for the UK would have negative repercussions for Ireland.
- 2. Brexit was predominately negative for Ireland, with concerns over hard borders, tariffs and loss of service export enterprises to the UK. Foreign direct investment and financial and other services were expected to relocate to Ireland post-Brexit.
- 3. Brexit brought pre-existing issues and problems with Dublin's capacity and infrastructure into sharper focus. These included office, hotel and residential accommodation as well as capacity at Dublin Airport, the M50 and public transport.
- 4. Tourism was one of the sectors that felt the immediate impact of Brexit through a weakened Sterling. Exporters were also immediately and adversely hit. Representatives from the tourism sector called for a united approach to resolving some of the issues and making sure Dublin could benefit from any increase in tourism associated with Brexit.
- 5. There was concern that British and Northern Irish students studying in Dublin, as well as for Irish students studying in the UK, faced the possibility of being treated as international rather than EU students after Brexit with much higher fees. There was also concern about the future of research partnerships between Ireland and UK educational institutions. It was felt Ireland could gain some research funding and also an advantage in being the only English-speaking member state. It was suggested that regulatory bodies such as the European Medicines Board could relocate from London to Dublin.
- 6. Issues and concerns raised during the Summit are to be brought to the attention of the national negotiators ahead of negotiations taking place so that Dublin's interests can be best represented during those talks.



Appendix 1: List of speakers in order of contribution

- 1. Paul McAuliffe, Dublin City Councillor, Chairperson Enterprise and Economic Development Strategic Policy Committee, Dublin City Council, Fianna Fail
- 2. Eoghan Murphy TD, Minister of State for Financial Services, eGovernment and Public Procurement
- 3. Dominic Chilcott, British Ambassador to Ireland
- 4. Brendan Carr, Lord Mayor of Dublin, Labour
- 5. Dan O'Brien, Institute of International and European Affairs
- 6. John McGrane, British-Irish Chamber of Commerce
- 7. Peter Rigney, Irish Congress of Trade Unions
- 8. Simon McKeever, Irish Exporters Association
- 9. Richard Guiney, Dublin Town
- 10. Mary Freehill, Dublin City Councillor, Leader of the Irish delegation on the Committee of the European Regions
- 11. Deirdre Heney, Dublin City Councillor, Fianna Fail
- 12. Greg Kelly, Dublin City Councillor, Sinn Fein
- 13. Micheal MacDonncha, Dublin City Councillor, Sinn Fein
- 14. Dermot Mulligan, Assistant Secretary, Innovation and Investment Division Department of Jobs, Enterprise and Innovation
- 15. Marie Hunt, CBRE
- 16. Patrick Davitt, Institute of Professional Auctioneers and Valuers
- 17. Kieran Rose, Senior City Planner
- 18. Alan Robinson, Docklands Business Forum
- 19. Michael O'Brien, Dublin City Councillor, Anti-Austerity Alliance
- 20. Tim Fenn, Irish Hotels Federation
- 21. Adrian Cummins, Restaurant Association of Ireland
- 22. Owen O'Mara Walsh, Irish Tourist Industry Confederation
- 23. Deiric O'Broin, Dublin City University
- 24. Aoife Ni Mhaolain, Trinity College Dublin
- 25. David Kirk, Dublin Institute of Technology
- 26. Graham Love, Health Research Board



